DID YOU HAVE A “WHERE’S WALDO?” MOMENT in looking at the front cover of this issue? In this case Waldo being a euphemism for one Usain Bolt, the most ridiculously popular trackster—and close to most-popular athlete period—on the planet. Once again Bolt has been racking up the post-season awards, including the Athlete Of The Year honor given by the IAAF (or more precisely, its partner, the International Athletics Foundation).

His counterpart on the women’s side in that last bit of voting was Allyson Felix, but you won’t find her as our No. 1. I chose either. We went with David Rudisha and Valerie Adams.

In the 25 years since the IAF started selecting AOs in ’88, we have matched each other some 60% of the time—15 instances on the men’s side and 16 on the women’s.

You say you can’t fathom how our international panel could not have chosen Bolt or Felix this year, what with each of them having left London with a trio of gold medals around their neck?

That’s in no small part because T&FN’s voting members are big on individual achievement, which means we think being on a fast relay team is a privilege restricted to those in a few events and from a very small number of powerful nations. Yes, there are individual relay legs that are indeed worthy of note, but just winning a gold medal in which you were only a quarter of the effort is not noteworthy. That consideration alone downgraded both Bolt and Felix enough in our voters’ eyes that they were passed over for others whose achievements were solely theirs and theirs alone.

The other reason I didn’t vote for Bolt (he was my No. 4) is simple: he was up against three men in Rudisha, Ashton Eaton and Aries Merritt who set spectacular World Records, and he didn’t. As is frequently the case, though, my AOY choice didn’t win. Like the biggest portion of the voters (see p. 10) I gave my No. 1 to Eaton, the only one of the three WR setters to be undefeated.

Yes, of course Eaton only competed in two decathlons (which is why enough members of the panel gave him low marks that he ended up No. 2 despite his edge in No. 1s). But from where I sat, while we learned that the others could be beaten, I saw absolutely no signs that anybody could have come close to Eaton. He could have competed in a dozen decathlons, and if his goal was simply not to lose he would have won them all. To me, his margin of superiority was just that clear.

It was that nebulous “margin” consideration that led me to give my top women’s vote to Adams over Jessica Ennis in a battle of those undefeateds. I didn’t see Adams possibly losing to anybody (at least anybody whose urine didn’t glow in the dark), but I thought that in a series of heptathlons, Ennis, spectacular as she was in her two outings, was beatable by Tatyana Chernova.

Another reason my personal AOY choices frequently swim against the mainstream is because—being a field & track kid of guy—I tend to reward jumpers and throwers who have only a single event the same as I do runners who can double.

Yes, there’s lots of value judgment in all this, but the key thing to remember is that T&FN’s choices are made on merit, not popularity.